UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS

FOR THE SECOND CIRCUIT

JUDGMENT

USDC SDNY
DOCUMENT
ELECTRONICALLY FILED
DOC #:
DATE FILED: 07/16/2010

At a Stated Term of the United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit, held at the Daniel Patrick Moynihan United States Courthouse, 500 Pearl Street, in the City of New York, on the 30th day of January, two thousand and nine.

BEFORE:

Hon. Rosemary S. Pooler, Hon. Barrington D. Parker, Hon. Richard C. Wesley,

Circuit Judges.

Docket Nos. 05-4863-cv (L), 05-6768-cv (Con)



Rabi Abdullahi, individually and as the natural guardian and personal representative of the estate of her daughter Lubabatau Abdullahi, Salisu Abullahi, individually and as the natural quardian and personal representative of the estate of his son Abulliahi (Manufi) Salisu, Alasan Abdullahi, individually and as the natural guardian and personal representative of the estate of his daughter Firdausi Abdullahi, Ali Hashimu, individually and as the natural guardian and personal representative of the estate of his daughter Suleiman, Muhammadu Inuwa, individually and as the natural guardian and personal representative of the estate of his son Abdullahi M. Inuwa, Magaji Alh Laden, individually and as the natural guardian and personal representative of the estate of his son Kabiru Isyaku, Alhaji Mustapha, individually and as the natural guardian and personal representative of the estate of his daughter Asma'u Mustapha, Suleiman Umar, individually and as the natural guardian and personal representative of the estate of his son Buhari Suleiman, Zainab Abdu, a minor, by her mother and natural guardian, Haja Abdullahi, Haji Abdullahi, individually, Firdausi Abdullahi, a minor, by her father and natural guardian Abdullahi Madawaki, Abdullahi Madawaki, individually, Sani Abdullahi, a minor, by his father and natural guardian, Sani Abdullahi, Abdullahi Ado, a minor, by his mother and natural guardian, Aisha Ado, Aisha Ado, individually, Abdumajid Ali, a minor, by his father and natural guardian, Alhaji Yusuf Ali, Nura Muhammad Ali, a minor, by his father and natural guardian, Muhammad Ali, Muhammad Ali, individually, Umar Badamasi, a minor, by his father and natural guardian, malam Badamasi Zubairu, Malam Badamasi Zubairu, individually, Muhammadu Fatahu Danladi, a minor, by his father and natural guardian, Alhaji Danladi Ibrahim, Alhaji Danaldi Ibrahim, individually, Dalha Hamza, a minor, by his father and natural guardian malam Hamza Gwammaja, Malam Gwammaja, individually, Tasiu Haruna, a minor, by his quardian Mukhtar Saleh, Mukhtar Saleh, individually, Muhyiddeen Haasan, a minor, by his father and natural guardian, Tijjani Hassan, Tijjani Hassan, individually, Kawu Adamu Ibrahim, a minor, by his father and natural guardian, Malam Abamus Ibrahim Adamu, Alhaji Ibrahim Haruna, individually, Mallam Idris, individually, Yusuf Idris, a minor, by his father and naturall guardian, Idris Umar, Idris Umar, individually, Hafsat Isa, a minor, by her father and natural guardian,, Isa Muhammed Isa, Isa Muhammed Isa, individually, Taju Isa, a minor, by her father and natural guardian, Malam Isa Usman, Malam Isa Docket Nos. 05-4863-cv (L), 05-6768-cv (CON) Page 2 January 30, 2009

Usman, individually, Hadiza Isyaku, a minor, by her father and natural guardian, Isyaki Shuaibu, Isyaku Shuaibu, individually, Zahra'u Jafaru, a minor, by her father and antural guardian, Jafru Baba, Jafaru Baba, individually, Anas Mohammed, a minor, by his father and natural guardian, Malam Mohammed, Malam Mohammed, individually, Nafisatu Muhammed, a minor, by her mother and natural guardian, Yahawasu Muhammed, Yahawasu Muhammed, individually, Muhsinu Tijjani, a minor, by his father and natural guardian, Tijjani Hassan, Alhaji Yusuf Ali, Maryam Idris, a minor, by her father and natural guardian, Malam Idris, Ajudu Ismaila Adamu, individually and as parent and natural guardian of Yahaya Ismaica, minor, Malam Mohammed, individually and as parent and natural quardian of Bashir Mohammed, minor, Malam Yusab Ya'u Amale, individually and as parent and natural guardian of Suyudi Yusals Yu'a, minor, Malasm Haruna Adamu, individually and as parent and natural quardian of Mohammed Tasi'u Haruna, minor, Zangon Kwajalawa, individually and as parent and natural guardian of Nuruddim Dauda, minor, Malam Dahauru Ya'y, individually and as parent and natural guardian of Rabi Dahuru, minor and as parent and natural guardian of Zainab Musa Dahuru, minor, Zangon Marikita, individually and as parent and natural guardian of Ismaila Musa, minor, Arhaji Muihammad Soia. individually and as parent and natural quardian and personal representative of Estate of Hamaza Achaji Muhammad, minor, deceased, Achaji Ibrahim Dankwalba, individually and as parent and natural quardian of Personal Representative of Est of Abdullahi Ibrahim, minor, Mallam Lawan, individually and as parent and natural guardian and personal representative of Est. of Aisha Lawan, minor, deceased, Alhaji Muhammed Tsohon Sojo, individually and as parent and natural guardian and personal representative of Est. of Unni Alhasi Muhammed, minor, Ismaila Zubairui, individually and as parent and natural guardian and personal representative of Est. of Mustapha Zubairu, minor, Deceased, Abubaker Musa, individually and as parent and natural of Sa`adatu Musa, Minor, Mohamed Abdu, individually and as parent and natural guardian of Haruna Abdu, Hassan, individually and as parent and natural guardian and personal representative of Est. of Sadiya Hassan, minor, deceased, Mallam Yakubu Umar, individually and as parent and natural guardian of, Mallam Samaila, individually and as parent and natural guardian of Adamu Samalia, minor, Musa Yahaya, individually and as parent and natural guardian of Ukhasa Musa, minor, Audu Ismailia Adamu, individually and as parent and natural guardian of Yashaya Samaila, Malam Musa Dahiru, individually and as parent, Malam Musa Zango, individually and as parent and natural guardian os Samaila Musa, minor, Mallam Alhassan Maihula, individually and as a parent and natural guardian of Najib Maihula, minor, Mallam Abdullah Gama, individually and as parent and natural guardian of Dankuma Gama, Minor, Dauda Nuhu, individually and as parent and natural guardian and personal representative of Est. of Hamisu Nuhu, minor, deceased, Mallam Abdullahi, individually and as parent and natural guardian and personal representative of Est. of Najaratu Adbullahi, minor, deceased, Malam Umaru Mohammed, individually and as parent and natural guardian and personal representative of Est. of Sule Mohammed, minor, deceased, Mallam Nasiru, individually and as parent and natural guardian and personal representative of Est. of Yusif Nasiru, minor, deceased, Yusuf Musa, individually and as parent and natural guardian and personal representative of Est. of Nafisatu Musa, minor, deceased, Mallam Muritala, individually and as parent and natural guardian and personal representative of Est. of Umaru Muritala, minor, deceased, Mallam Tanko, individually and as parent and natural quardian and personal representative of Est. of madina Tankol, minor Mallam Sheu, individually and as parent and natural guardian and personal representative of Est. of Madina Tankol, minor, deceased, Malam Kabiru Mohamed, individually and as parent and natural guardian and personal representative of Est. of Kabiru Mohamed, minor, deceased, Mallam Sule Abubakar, individually and as parent and natural quardian and personal Docket Nos. 05-4863-cv (L), 05-6768-cv (CON) Page 3

January 30, 2009

representative of Est. of Fatima Abubaker, minor, deceased, Mallam Idris, individually and as parent and natural quardian and personal representative of Est. of Baba Idris, minor, deceased, Mallam Mohamed Bashir, individually and as parent and natural guardian and personal representative of Est. of Sani Bashir, minor, deceased, Ibrahim, individually and as parent and natural quardian and personal representative of Est. Hassan Ibrahim, minor, deceased, Alhaji Shuaibu, individually and as parent and natural quardian and personal representative of Est. of Masjbatu Shuaibu, minor, deceased, Mallam Abdullahi Sale, individually and as parent and natural guardian and personal representative of Est. of Shamisiya Sale, minor, deceased, Mallam Ibrahim Amyarawa, individually and as parent and natural guardian and personal representative of Est. of Yahaya Ibrahim, minor, deceased, Mallam Abdu Abubaker, individually and as parent and natural guardian and personal representative of Est. of Nasitu Abubaker, minor, deceased, Mallam Yusuf, individually and as parent and natural quardian and personal representative of Est. of Hodiza Yusuf, minor, deceased, Mallam Dauda Yusuf, individually and as parent and natural guardian and personal representative of Est. of Abubaker Sheu, minor, deceased, Maliam Mohammed Sheu, individually and as parent and natural guardian and personal representative of Est. of Mustapha Yakubu, minor, deceased, Alhaji Ubah, individually and as parent and natural guardian and personal representative of Est. of Maryam Ubah, minor, deceased, Mallam Mohamadu Jabbo, individually and as parent and natural quardian of Auwalu Mohamadu, Mallam Abdullah Adamu, individually and as parent and natural quardian and personal representative of Est. of Abdullah Adamu, minor,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

٧.

Pfizer, Inc.,

Defendant-Appellee.

Appeal from the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York.

This cause came on to be heard on the transcript of record from the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York and was argued by counsel.

ON CONSIDERATION THEREOF, it is hereby ORDERED, ADJUDGED, and DECREED that the judgments of the district court are REVERSED and REMANDED back to the district court for further proceedings in accordance with the opinion of this COURT.

> FOR THE COURT, CATHERINE O'HAGAN WOLFE, Clerk

A True Copy

Catherine O'Hagan Wol

United States Court of Appears, Second Circuit